### UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

GENLYTE THOMAS GROUP LLC, a Delaware Limited Liability Company Plaintiff,

v.

Civil Action No. 05-CV-10945 WGY

ARCHITECTURAL LIGHTING SYSTEMS. a division of ARCH LIGHTING GROUP, a **Rhode Island Corporation** 

Defendant.

# PLAINTIFF'S MOTION IN LIMINE TO EXCLUDE TESTIMONY REGARDING INVALIDITY OF U.S. PATENT NO. 5,238.254

Plaintiff, Genlyte Thomas Group LLC ("Genlyte"), by counsel, submits this Motion in Limine to exclude at the trial of this cause, any and all testimony regarding or relating to invalidity of the patent-in-suit, U.S. Patent No. 5,238,254 ("the '254 Patent").

As grounds for this motion, Genlyte states that the Joint Pretrial Memorandum [D.E. 42] in this case does not include any defense or ground of invalidity of the '254 Patent. This was confirmed in chambers. Nevertheless, when Genlyte deposed Defendant's proffered expert Dr. Ian Lewin ("Lewin"), Lewin attempted to insert invalidity as part of his answers to deposing counsel's questions (Lewin Depo. p. 50, Lines 5-16; p. 52, Line 18- p. 53, Line 8). Ultimately, however, Lewin conceded that he was only offering (if permitted<sup>1</sup>) opinion testimony on the issue of infringement of the '254 Patent (Lewin Depo. p. 54, Line 24 – p. 55, Line 2; p. 59, Line 17 – p. 60, Line 3).

By this motion, Genlyte seeks confirmation by Order of the Court that no testimony may be proffered, adduced or accepted on the issue of invalidity of the '254 Patent under the ground of 35 U.S.C. §§ 102, 103 or 112.

## Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Kevin Gannon

James E. Milliman (Pro hac vice) James R. Higgins, Jr. (Pro hac vice) Robert J. Theuerkauf (Pro hac vice) MIDDLETON REUTLINGER 2500 Brown & Williamson Tower Louisville KY 40202

Telephone: (502) 584-1135 Facsimile: (502) 561-0442

-and-

Thomas C. O'Konski BBO#337475 Kevin Gannon BBO#640931 CESARI AND MCKENNA, LLP 88 Black Falcon Avenue Boston, MA 02210 Telephone: (617) 951-2500

Facsimile: (617) 951-3927

Counsel for Plaintiff, Genlyte Thomas Group LLC

#### Certificate of Service

I hereby certify that this document(s) filed through the ECF system will be sent electronically to the registered participants as identified on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) and paper copies will be sent to those indicated as non registered participants on this 19th day of January, 2007.

> /s/ Kevin Gannon Counsel for Plaintiff, Genlyte Thomas Group LLC

Genlyte has filed a motion to exclude Lewin's testimony and report based on his deposition testimony.

#### UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

GENLYTE THOMAS GROUP LLC, a Delaware Limited Liability Company Plaintiff,

v.

Civil Action No. 05-CV-10945 WGY

ARCHITECTURAL LIGHTING SYSTEMS. a division of ARCH LIGHTING GROUP, a **Rhode Island Corporation** 

Defendant.

# **Order Granting** PLAINTIFF'S MOTION IN LIMINE TO EXCLUDE TESTIMONY REGARDING INVALIDITY OF U.S. PATENT NO. 5,238.254

On motion of Plaintiff, Genlyte Thomas Group LLC ("Genlyte") to exclude at the trial of this cause, any and all testimony regarding or relating to invalidity of the patentin-suit, U.S. Patent No. 5,238,254 ("the '254 Patent"), and the Court having considered said motion and any response thereto, and after reviewing the Record in this case, and being sufficiently advised,

IT IS ORDERED that Plaintiff's motion is granted. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that no testimony may be proffered, adduced or accepted on the issue of invalidity of the '254 Patent under any ground of 35 U.S.C. §§ 102, 103 or 112.

SO ORDERED THIS \_\_\_ DAY OF JANUARY, 2007.

U.S. District Judge	

#### TENDERED BY:

## /s/ Kevin Gannon

James E. Milliman (Pro hac vice)
James R. Higgins, Jr. (Pro hac vice)
Robert J. Theuerkauf (Pro hac vice)
MIDDLETON REUTLINGER
2500 Brown & Williamson Tower
Louisville KY 40202
Telephone: (502) 584-1135

Telephone: (502) 584-1135 Facsimile: (502) 561-0442

-and-

Thomas C. O'Konski BBO#337475 Kevin Gannon BBO#640931 CESARI AND MCKENNA, LLP 88 Black Falcon Avenue Boston, MA 02210

Telephone: (617) 951-2500 Facsimile: (617) 951-3927

Counsel for Plaintiff, Genlyte Thomas Group LLC